- 1 HB244
- 2 156489-2
- 3 By Representative Hill
- 4 RFD: Ethics and Campaign Finance
- 5 First Read: 15-JAN-14

1	156489-2:n	:01/14/2014:LLR/tan LRS2014-60R1
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8	SYNOPSIS:	Under existing law, the Open Meetings Act of
9		2005 specifically applies to quorums of committees
10		and subcommittees of governmental bodies. In 2012,
11		the Alabama Supreme Court, in a 5-4 decision, ruled
12		that the Open Meetings Act did not apply to a
13		series of committee or subcommittee gatherings at
14		which discussions were conducted on matters that
15		would later come before the full governmental body.
16		In 2013, the Alabama Supreme Court ruled, in a 5-3
17		decision, that citizens do not have standing to
18		bring suits under the Open Meetings Act if the
19		civil penalty is paid to the state and there is no
20		allegation of a likelihood of future violations.
21		Also in 2013, the Alabama Supreme Court stated that
22		there is no requirement that the Alabama
23		Legislature hold open meetings.
24		This bill would define and expressly
25		prohibit serial meetings.
26		This bill would further define the terms
27		deliberation, governmental body, and meeting, to

clarify that the Open Meetings Act of 2005 applies to meetings of the Alabama Legislature, committees, or subcommittees of governmental bodies involving the exchange of information or ideas among a quorum of members of the committee, subcommittee, or full governmental body intended to arrive at or influence a decision as to how any members of the governmental body should vote on a specific matter that, at the time of the exchange, the participating members expect to come before the committee, subcommittee, or full governmental body immediately following the discussion or at a later time.

This bill would provide that both houses of the Alabama Legislature and their committees shall meet in public unless there is a public vote taken by the respective house or committee that the meeting requires secrecy.

This bill would provide that private citizens may bring civil actions under the Open Meetings Act, that penalties may not exceed the greater of one thousand dollars or one-half the monthly salary of a defendant for service on the governmental body, and that the prevailing plaintiff shall receive any penalties awarded against the defendants.

Α	BILL

TO BE ENTITLED

3 AN ACT

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Relating to the Open Meetings Act of 2005; to amend Sections 36-25A-1, 36-25A-2, 36-25A-3, and 36-25A-9, Code of Alabama 1975, to define and prohibit serial meetings; to further define deliberation, governmental body, and meeting to apply to the exchange of information or ideas among a quorum of members of a committee, subcommittee, or full governmental body intended to arrive at or influence a decision as to how any members of the governmental body should vote on a specific matter that, at the time of the exchange, the participating members expect to come before the committee, subcommittee, or full governmental body immediately following the discussion or at a later time; to require the Alabama Legislature to meet with doors open to the public unless a motion to go into executive session is made and a vote is taken that secrecy is required under the circumstances; to provide that a violation of this chapter is a concrete and particularized injury to every citizen of Alabama; to provide for penalties assessed under this chapter payable to the prevailing plaintiff; and to provide a maximum penalty for each meeting not to exceed one thousand dollars or one-half of the defendant's monthly salary for service on the governmental body, whichever is greater. BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF ALABAMA:

Section 1. Sections 36-25A-1, 36-25A-2, 36-25A-3, and 36-25A-9, Code of Alabama 1975, are amended to read as follows:

4 "\$36-25A-1.

"(a) It is the policy of this state that the deliberative process of governmental bodies shall be open to the public during meetings as defined in Section 36-25A-2(6). Except for executive sessions permitted in Section 36-25A-7(a) or as otherwise expressly provided by other federal or state statutes, all meetings of a governmental body shall be open to the public and no meetings of a governmental body may be held without providing notice pursuant to the requirements of Section 36-25A-3. No executive sessions are required by this chapter to be held under any circumstances. Electronic Serial meetings or electronic communications shall not be utilized to circumvent any of the provisions of this chapter.

"(b) This chapter shall be known and may be cited as the "Alabama Open Meetings Act."

"§36-25A-2.

"As used in and for determining the applicability of this chapter, the following words shall have the following meanings solely for the purposes of this chapter:

"(1) DELIBERATION. An exchange of information or ideas among a quorum of members of a <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, <u>or full</u> governmental body intended to arrive at or influence a decision as to how <u>the any</u> members of the <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, <u>or full</u> governmental body should vote on a specific

- matter that, at the time of the exchange, the participating
 members expect to come before the <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, or

 <u>full</u> body immediately following the discussion or at a later
 time.
 - "(2) EXECUTIVE SESSION. That portion of a meeting of a <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, <u>or full</u> governmental body from which the public is excluded for one or more of the reasons prescribed in Section 36-25A-7(a).
- 9 "(3) GENERAL REPUTATION AND CHARACTER.

 10 Characteristics or actions of a person directly involving good

or bad ethical conduct, moral turpitude, or suspected criminal activity, not including job performance.

"(4) GOVERNMENTAL BODY. All boards, bodies, and commissions of the executive and legislative departments of the state or its political subdivisions or municipalities which expend or appropriate public funds; all multimember governing bodies of departments, agencies, institutions, and instrumentalities of the executive and legislative departments of the state or its political subdivisions or municipalities, including, without limitation, all corporations and other instrumentalities whose governing boards are comprised of a majority of members who are appointed or elected by the state or its political subdivisions, counties, or municipalities; and all quasi-judicial bodies of the executive and legislative departments of the state; and all standing, special, or advisory committees or subcommittees of, or appointed by, the

- body. The term "governmental body" does not include any of the
 following:
- 3 "a. Legislative party caucuses or coalitions.

- "b. Alabama appellate or trial courts, except as required by the constitution of this state or any body governed by rules of the Alabama Supreme Court.
 - "c. Voluntary membership associations comprised of public employees, counties, municipalities, or their instrumentalities which have not been delegated any legislative or executive functions by the Legislature or Governor.
 - "(5) JOB PERFORMANCE. The observed conduct or actions of a public employee or public official while on the job in furtherance of his or her assigned duties. Job performance includes whether a person is meeting, exceeding, or failing to meet job requirements or whether formal employment actions should be taken by the governmental body. Job performance does not include the general reputation and character of the person being discussed.
 - "(6) MEETING. a. Subject to the limitations herein, the term meeting shall only apply to the following:
 - "1. The prearranged gathering of a quorum of a governmental body or a quorum of a committee or subcommittee of a governmental body at a time and place which is set by law or operation of law.
 - "2. The prearranged gathering of a quorum of a governmental body or a quorum of a committee or subcommittee

of a governmental body during which the <u>full governmental</u>
body, committee, or subcommittee of the governmental body is
authorized, either by law or otherwise, to exercise the powers
which it possesses or approve the expenditure of public funds.

"3. The gathering, whether or not it was prearranged, of a quorum of a governmental body or a quorum of a committee or a subcommittee of a governmental body during which the members of the <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, <u>or full</u> governmental body deliberate specific matters that, at the time of the exchange, the participating members expect to come before the <u>full governmental</u> body, committee, or subcommittee at a later date.

"b. The term "meeting" shall not include:

- "1. Occasions when a quorum of a governmental body, committee, or subcommittee attends social gatherings, conventions, conferences, training programs, press conferences, media events, or otherwise gathers so long as the subcommittee, committee, or full governmental body does not deliberate specific matters that, at the time of the exchange, the participating members expect to come before the subcommittee, committee, or full governmental body at a later date.
- "2. Occasions when a quorum of a <u>subcommittee</u>, <u>committee</u>, <u>or full</u> governmental body gathers, in person or by electronic communication, with state or federal officials for the purpose of reporting or obtaining information or seeking

support for issues of importance to the <u>subcommittee</u>, committee, or full governmental body.

- "(7) OPEN OR PUBLIC PORTION OF A MEETING. The open or public portion of a meeting is that portion which has not been closed for executive session in accordance with this chapter, for which prior notice was given in compliance with this chapter, and which is conducted so that constituents of the governmental body, members of the media, persons interested in the activities of the governmental body, and citizens of this state could, if they desired, attend and observe.
- "(8) PROFESSIONAL COMPETENCE. The ability of an individual to practice a profession within the profession's acceptable standards of care and responsibility. A profession is a vocation requiring certification by the State of Alabama or passage of a state licensing examination that may only be granted to or taken by persons who have completed at least three years of college-level education and obtained at least a college-level degree.
- "(9) PUBLIC EMPLOYEE. Any person employed at the state, county, or municipal levels of government or their instrumentalities, including governmental corporations and authorities, who is paid in whole or in part from state, county, or municipal funds. A public employee does not include a person employed on a part-time basis whose employment is limited to providing professional services other than

lobbying, the compensation for which constitutes less than 50 percent of the part-time employee's income.

"(10) PUBLIC FUNDS. Taxes or fees charged or collected by a governmental body or from the sale of public property including, but not limited to, matching funds from the federal government or income derived from the investment of taxes or fees.

"(11) PUBLIC OFFICIAL. Any person elected to public office, whether or not that person has taken office, by the vote of the people at state, county, or municipal levels of government or their instrumentalities, including governmental corporations, and any person appointed to a position at the state, county, or municipal levels of government or their instrumentalities, including governmental corporations.

"(12) QUORUM. Unless otherwise provided by law, a quorum is a majority of the voting members of a governmental body. Except where a governmental body is prohibited from holding a non-emergency meeting as defined in subdivision (6)a.1. between the date of election of members and the date such members take office, any person elected to serve on a governmental body shall be counted in the determination of whether a quorum of that governmental body is present, except for any meeting as defined in subdivisions (6)a.1. and 2., beginning on the date of certification of the results of the general election. In the case of appointment to a governmental body, any person shall be counted in the determination of whether a quorum of that governmental body is present, except

for any meeting as defined in subdivisions (6)a.1. and 2.,

from the date that the appointment is made or issued whether

or not the appointment is effective on that date.

"(13) SERIAL MEETING. Any series of (less than a quorum) meetings for which no notice or opportunity to attend was provided to the public in accordance with the Alabama Open Meetings Act and where a. the members attending one or more of the meetings collectively constitute at least a quorum of the members of the governmental body and b. the members in attendance at each meeting in the series engage in deliberation concerning the same matter.

"\$36-25A-3.

- "(a) Unless otherwise specified by law and as provided herein, any governmental body subject to this chapter, except for an advisory board, advisory commission, advisory committee, task force, or other advisory body created solely to make recommendations on public policy issues and composed of persons who do not receive compensation for their service as members of such board, commission, committee, task force, or body from public funds, shall post notice of all meetings, as defined in Section 36-25A-2(6)a.1., at least seven calendar days prior to the meeting as follows:
- "(1) The Alabama Constitution requires the Alabama

 Legislature to meet with their doors open to the public unless
 a motion to go into executive session is made and a vote is
 taken that secrecy is required under the circumstances. The
 respective houses of the Alabama Legislature shall develop

written rules consistent with the Constitution of Alabama of 1901, providing for access to and prior notice of all sessions and standing committee and standing subcommittee meetings and all meetings of permanent and joint legislative committees.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"(2) Any governmental body with statewide jurisdiction shall submit notice of its meeting to the Secretary of State. The Secretary of State shall post the notice on the Internet for at least seven calendar days prior to the day of the meeting. The Secretary of State shall also send electronic mail notifications to anyone who has registered with the Secretary of State to receive notification of meetings. The Secretary of State may promulgate reasonable rules and regulations necessary for the uniform receipt and posting of notice and of registration for electronic mail notification. The Secretary of State shall provide during regular office hours a computer terminal at a place convenient to the public in the office of the Secretary of State that members of the public may use to view notices of meetings posted by the Secretary of State. Any governmental body with less than statewide jurisdiction may also submit notice to the Secretary of State for posting on the website. Nothing shall prevent a governmental body subject to this subsection from posting notice in any additional manner.

"(3) A municipal governmental body shall post notice of each meeting on a bulletin board at a place convenient to the public in the city hall, provided, however, that a corporation a majority of whose governing board is appointed

or elected by a municipality and that has a principal office separate from the city hall may, in lieu of posting notice in the city hall, post notice of each meeting on a bulletin board at a place convenient to the public in the principal office of the corporation or other instrumentality.

- "(4) A local school board shall post notice of each meeting on a bulletin board at a place convenient to the public in the central administrative office of the board.
- "(5) Any other governmental body shall post notice of each meeting in a reasonable location or shall use a reasonable method of notice that is convenient to the public. Any change of the location or method for posting notices of meetings shall not take effect until the change has been approved at an open meeting by the members of the governmental body and announced to the public at an open meeting.
- "(6) If practicable, a governmental body other than those with statewide jurisdiction, in addition to the posting requirements, shall provide direct notification of a meeting, as defined in Section 36-25A-2(6)a., to any member of the public or news media covering that governmental body who has registered with the governmental body to receive notification of meetings. A governmental body may promulgate reasonable rules and regulations necessary for the uniform registration and payment for direct notice and for the distribution of the notices. The governmental body may choose to transmit a notice using electronic mail, telephone, facsimile, the United States Postal Service, or any other method reasonably likely to

provide the requested notice. The actual cost of issuing notices, if there is one, may be required to be paid in advance by the person requesting notice by the governmental body. Direct notice to persons who have registered with the governmental body shall, at a minimum, contain the time, date, and place of the meeting.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"(b) Unless otherwise specified by law directly applicable to the governmental body, notice of a meeting, as defined in Section 36-25A-2(6)a.2. and 3. as well as meetings called pursuant to Section 11-43-50 shall be posted as soon as practicable after the meeting is called and in no event less than 24 hours before the meeting is scheduled to begin, unless such notice (i) is prevented by emergency circumstances requiring immediate action to avoid physical injury to persons or damage to property; or (ii) relates to a meeting to be held solely to accept the resignation of a public official or employee. In such situations, notice shall be given as soon as practical, but in no case less than one hour before the meeting is to begin. At the same time general notice is given, special notice shall be directed to any person who has registered to receive direct notices pursuant to the provisions of subsection (a) (6).

"(c) Posted notice pursuant to this section shall include the time, date, and place of meeting. If a preliminary agenda is created, it shall be posted as soon as practicable in the same location or manner as the notice given pursuant to this section. A governmental body may discuss at a meeting

additional matters not included in the preliminary agenda. If a preliminary agenda is not available, the posted notice shall include a general description of the nature and purpose of the meeting.

- "(d) County commissions which provide proper notice in conformance with Section 11-3-8 shall not be required to comply with subsections (a), (b), and (c) of this section, nor shall committees or subcommittees of such commissions so long as the committees also comply with the notice procedures applicable to the full commission in Section 11-3-8.
- "(e) Governmental bodies may give, but shall not be required to give, notice of quasi-judicial or contested case hearings which could properly be conducted as an executive session under this chapter or existing state law.
- "(f) A governmental body is authorized, but not required, to provide notice in addition to that specified in this section and to provide notice for gatherings which are not meetings as defined in Section 36-25A-2(6).

"§36-25A-9.

"(a) Enforcement Any violation of this chapter
results in a concrete and particularized injury to every
citizen of Alabama. This chapter is designed and intended to
redress such injury by holding members of the governmental
bodies and the bodies themselves accountable to the public for
violations of this chapter. Therefore, enforcement of this
chapter may be sought by civil action brought in the county
where the governmental body's primary office is located by any

media organization, any Alabama citizen, the Attorney General, or the district attorney for the circuit in which the governmental body is located; provided, however, that no member of a governmental body may serve as a plaintiff in an action brought against another member of the same governmental body for an alleged violation of this chapter. The complaint shall be verified, shall state specifically the applicable ground or grounds for the complaint as set out in subdivisions (1) through (4) of subsection (b), and shall name in their official capacity all members of the governmental body remaining in attendance at the alleged meeting held in violation of this chapter. Members of a governmental body who are named as a defendant in a complaint under this chapter shall serve an initial response to the complaint within seven business days of personal service of the complaint. A preliminary hearing on the complaint filed shall be held no later than 10 business days after the date of the filing of the defendant or defendants' initial response to the complaint or, if no response is filed, no later than 17 business days after the filing of the complaint, or on the nearest day thereafter as the court shall fix, having regard to the speediest possible determination of the cause consistent with the rights of the parties.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"(b) In the preliminary hearing on the complaint, the plaintiff shall establish by a preponderance of the evidence that a meeting of the governmental body occurred and that each defendant attended the meeting. Additionally, to

- establish a prima facie case the plaintiff must present substantial evidence of one or more of the following claims:
- "(1) That the defendants disregarded the
 requirements for proper notice of the meeting pursuant to the
 applicable methods set forth in Section 36-25A-3.

- "(2) That the defendants disregarded the provisions of this chapter during a meeting, other than during an executive session.
- "(3) That the defendants voted to go into executive session and while in executive session the defendants discussed matters other than those subjects included in the motion to convene an executive session as required by Section 36-25A-7 (b).
- "(4) That, other than a claim under subdivisions (1) through (3), the defendants intentionally violated other provisions of this chapter.
 - "(c) If the court finds that the plaintiff has met its initial burden of proof as required in subsection (b) at the preliminary hearing, the court shall establish a schedule for discovery and set the matter for a hearing on the merits. If, at the preliminary hearing, the plaintiff has presented its prima facie case that an executive session appears to have been improperly conducted as set out in subsection (b) (3), the defendants shall bear the burden of proof at the hearing on the merits to prove by a preponderance of the evidence that the discussions during the executive session were limited to

matters related to the subjects included in the motion to convene an executive session required in Section 36-25A-7(a).

- "(d) During a proceeding involving claims brought under subsection (b)(3), the court shall conduct an in camera proceeding or adopt another procedure as necessary to protect the confidentiality of the matters discussed during the executive session, and if there is a determination that the executive session was authorized by this chapter, the matters shall not be disclosed or utilized in any other legal proceeding by any individual or attorney who attends the in camera portion of the proceedings.
- "(e) Upon proof by a preponderance of the evidence of a defendant's violation of this chapter, the circuit court shall issue an appropriate final order including, if appropriate, a declaratory judgment or injunction. Prior to a final determination of the merits, temporary restraining orders or preliminary injunctions may be issued upon proper motion and proof as provided and required in the Alabama Rules of Civil Procedure. A final order on the merits shall be issued within 60 days after the preliminary hearing unless a longer period is consented to by all parties and the court.
- "(f) The court may invalidate the action or actions taken during a meeting held in violation of this chapter, provided that the complaint is filed within 21 days of the date when the action is made public, the violation was not the result of mistake, inadvertence, or excusable neglect, and invalidation of the governmental action taken would not unduly

prejudice third parties who have changed their position or taken action in good faith reliance upon the challenged action of the governmental body; provided further, however, that any action taken at an open meeting conducted in a manner consistent with this chapter shall not be invalidated because of a violation of this chapter which occurred prior to such meeting.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

"(g) A final order issued against a defendant shall state specifically upon which claim or claims in subdivisions (1) through (4) the ruling is based. For each meeting proven to be held in violation of this chapter for one or more reasons, the court shall impose a civil penalty payable to the plaintiff(s). The maximum penalty for each meeting shall not exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000) or one half of the defendant's monthly salary for service on the governmental body, whichever is less greater. With regard to claims related to improper discussions during executive sessions, monetary penalties may only be assessed against defendant members of a governmental body who voted to go into an executive session and who remained in the executive session during a discussion determined by the court not to have been authorized by this chapter. Penalties imposed against a member of a governmental body found to have acted in violation of this chapter shall not be paid by nor reimbursed to the member by the governmental body he or she serves.

"(h) A governmental body is authorized to pay for or provide for the legal expenses of present or former members of

the body named as defendants in a proceeding under this

chapter."

Section 2. This act shall become effective on the

first day of the third month following its passage and

approval by the Governor, or its otherwise becoming law.