By Representative England
RFD: Constitution, Campaigns and Elections
First Read: 07-FEB-12

SYNOPSIS: Under existing law, candidates for state attorney general and state appellate judicial offices, including the offices of Chief Justice and Associate Justice of the Supreme Court, Judge of the Court of Criminal Appeals, and Judge of the Court of Civil Appeals, are nominated by political parties and are included on the general election ballots in a column under the party name and emblem. A person elected to state appellate judicial office must, at the end of a six-year term, stand for reelection in a contested election rather than in a retention election in which the only issue is whether that person shall be retained in office.

This bill would provide for the nonpartisan election of candidates for state attorney general and state appellate judicial office. The bill would require a special ballot for state attorney general and state appellate judicial candidates. The bill would provide for a filing fee to be paid by
candidates for state attorney general and state appellate judicial office to the Secretary of State, to be split between the political parties. The bill would provide for filing with the Secretary of State an affidavit of indigency in lieu of payment of the filing fee. The bill also would provide that a person elected to a state appellate judicial office stands for reelection at the end of his or her term in the form of $a$ retention election, rather than a contested election. The bill also would establish a judicial evaluation commission to evaluate performance of a state appellate judicial officer standing for reelection in a retention election.

A BILL
TO BE ENTITLED
AN ACT

To provide for the nonpartisan election of the state attorney general and for the appellate judges; to require a special ballot for state appellate judicial candidates; to provide for a filing fee to be paid by appellate judicial candidates, to be split between the political parties; to provide for filing with the Secretary of State of an affidavit of indigency in lieu of payment of the filing fee; to amend Sections 17-6-20, 17-6-24, 17-6-25, 17-6-48, and 17-13-8, Code
of Alabama 1975, relating to election of judges and justices and election procedures; to provide for retention elections for appellate judicial officers seeking reelection; and to establish a judicial evaluation commission to evaluate the performance of an appellate judicial officer seeking reelection through a retention election. BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF ALABAMA:

Section 1. This act shall be known as the "Make Justice Just Act."

Section 2. As used in this act, "Attorney General" means the Office of the Alabama Attorney General, and "state appellate judicial office" means the offices of Chief Justice and Associate Justice of the Supreme Court, Judge of the Court of Criminal Appeals, and Judge of the Court of Civil Appeals. "Appellate judicial officer" means the Chief Justice or an Associate Justice of the Alabama Supreme Court, a Judge of the Court of Criminal Appeals, or a Judge of the Court of Civil Appeals. The term "state appellate judicial office" does not include the office of circuit court judge, district court judge, judge of probate, municipal court judge, circuit court clerk, deputy circuit court clerk, or district attorney. The term "state appellate judicial officer" does not include a circuit court judge, district court judge, judge of probate, municipal court judge, circuit court clerk, deputy circuit court clerk, or district attorney.

Section 3. State appellate judicial offices and the state attorney general shall be nonpartisan and candidates for those offices shall be elected on a nonpartisan basis.

Section 4. (a) Not later than 60 days before the date of the primary election as provided in Section 17-13-3, Code of Alabama 1975, any candidate for a state appellate judicial office and for state attorney general shall file a declaration of candidacy with the Secretary of State. A candidate for any state appellate judicial office or state attorney general shall not designate any party affiliation in his or her declaration for candidacy, or in any manner relating to his or her candidacy.
(b) Each candidate, at the time of the filing, shall pay to the Secretary of State a qualifying fee in an amount equal to two percent of the annual salary paid at the time of filing by the State of Alabama for the appellate judicial office for which the candidate seeks election. Any local supplements or expense allowances which may be paid are not to be considered salary for purposes of calculating the two percent qualifying fee. The Secretary of State shall deposit the qualifying fee as soon as practicable in equal amounts to the two political parties receiving the most votes in the previous election. In lieu of the filing fee required by this subsection, a candidate for appellate judicial office or state attorney general may file an affidavit of indigency with the Secretary of State. The content of such affidavit shall be as determined by the Secretary of State.

Section 5. If a state appellate judicial office or state attorney general is to be filled at any election or primary election, the state attorney general and all state appellate judicial offices to be filled and the names of all candidates therefor shall appear on the official nonpartisan judicial ballot. No political party designation shall be included on the official nonpartisan ballot.

Section 6. The names of the candidates on the official nonpartisan ballot shall be listed on the ballot in alphabetical order by surname and the offices shall be listed in the following order:
(1) Supreme Court.
(2) Court of Civil Appeals.
(3) Court of Criminal Appeals.
(4) State Attorney General.

Section 7. In each nonpartisan primary election and general election of a state appellate judicial office, where two or more justices or judges are to be elected at the same time, each of the places shall be designated by number on the official nonpartisan appellate judicial ballot. Not less than 10 days before the time for filing declarations of candidacy for election to any state appellate judicial office, the Secretary of State shall, in each case, designate the positions to be filled by consecutive number commencing with one. Each candidate for state appellate judicial office shall designate in the declaration of his or her candidacy and in his or her request to have his or her name placed on the
official nonpartisan appellate judicial election ballot the number of the place for which he or she is a candidate. The name of each qualified candidate shall be printed on the official nonpartisan appellate ballot used at any election beneath the title of the office and the number of the place for which he or she is seeking election. The state appellate judicial offices so designated shall be dealt with as separate offices for all election purposes and the candidates for each place shall be separately elected, as the case may be. No person shall be a candidate or be permitted to file a declaration for more than one place. No ballot shall be counted for any candidate except for the place and number designated in the declaration of his or her candidacy. Section 8. State appellate judicial offices and attorney general candidates therefor shall appear separately on a nonpartisan ballot in substantially the following form: "Official Nonpartisan Ballot Chief Justice of Supreme Court (in those years when a Chief Justice is to be elected)
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Associate Justice of Supreme Court
___ to be elected
Place No. 1
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Place No. 2
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Place No. 3
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Judge of the Court of Civil Appeals
___ to be elected
Place No. 1
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Place No. 2
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Place No. 3
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
Judge of the Court of Criminal Appeals
___ to be elected
Place No. 1
$\qquad$
Place No. 2
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

Place No. 3
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
State Attorney General

Section 9. (a) The election for state appellate judicial office and state attorney general shall be at the time and place provided by statute for holding first primary elections for nonjudicial offices.
(b) The names of all the candidates filing declarations for state appellate judicial office and attorney general shall appear on the official nonpartisan section of the election ballot for the office. The Secretary of State shall publicly determine and declare whether any candidate for a state appellate judicial office or attorney general has received a majority of the votes cast for the office. If a candidate for state judicial office or attorney general has received a majority of the votes cast for the office, the candidate's name shall appear on the general election ballot.

If a candidate does not receive a majority of the votes cast in the initial nonpartisan election for a state appellate judicial office or attorney general, the Secretary of State shall determine and declare the two persons who received the highest number of votes in the initial nonpartisan election for nomination for that office. The names of the two persons who received the highest number of votes shall appear on the general election ballot under the designation for the office.
(c) If only one person files a declaration of candidacy for a state appellate judicial office or attorney general, only the name of that person shall be printed on the nonpartisan judicial appellate ballot at the general election under the designation for that office, followed by a space for the writing in of any other name by a voter. The Secretary of State shall determine and declare that the candidate who has received the highest number of votes cast in the general election is elected to that state appellate judicial office or the state attorney general. In all elections where there is a tie between the two candidates for the same state judicial office, the Chief Justice of the Alabama Supreme Court, or if the Chief Justice is a candidate in that election, then the senior Associate Justice of the Supreme Court who is not a candidate in that election, in the presence of the Governor, shall decide the tie by lot.
(d) The certificates of the board of supervisors of each county as to the election for state appellate judicial office and the state attorney general shall be forwarded by
the judge of probate to the Secretary of State within 10 days after the election. The Secretary of State shall, within 10 days after receiving the returns of elections from the judge of probate of each county, furnish, from a count of the actual vote cast, as it appears by the returns certified to him or her, certificates of election to each state appellate judicial office and attorney general to be filled at that election. Section 10. Retention Elections for Judicial Officers.
(a) Eligibility. Appellate judicial officers who have been elected one or more times by the partisan electoral procedure heretofore provided for by law, or under the nonpartisan election procedures provided by this act, at the expiration of his or her term, may seek retention in office as provided for herein. An appellate judicial officer who holds his or her office by appointment to fill a vacancy pursuant to Section 153 of the Constitution of Alabama of 1901, now appearing as Section 153 of the Official Recompilation of the Constitution of Alabama of 1901, as amended, as the same may from time to time be amended, as implemented by Sections 17-4-6 and 17-4-8 of the Code of Alabama 1975, shall not be eligible to seek retention in office by a retention election hereunder until the expiration of a term to which he or she shall have been elected through a nonpartisan election as provided for by this act.
(1) Procedure for Qualification for Retention. To qualify for a retention election, a justice or an appellate
judge must be evaluated as provided below and, after such evaluation, must file in the office of the Secretary of State within a reasonable time before the general election in the year preceding the expiration of the term for which he or she was elected, appointed, or retained, a declaration that he or she will be a candidate for retention. The Judicial Evaluation Commission shall establish the deadline for filing the declaration for retention with the Secretary of State. A justice or an appellate judge appointed, and having taken the oath of office after the deadline for qualification for retention election in the year preceding the expiration of the term of office, shall serve the balance of the term, and upon expiration of the term of office a vacancy shall exist which shall be filled by appointment.
(2) Judicial Evaluation. The retention election shall be preceded by a judicial evaluation as provided below that will provide information to voters prior to the election.
(b) Judicial Retention Ballot. A nonpartisan judicial ballot shall be provided for each justice or judge seeking an additional term for an appellate judicial office. The ballot shall read substantially as follows:
"Shall_be retained for six years as a [justice] (judge) of the $\qquad$ [Supreme Court] [Court of Civil Appeals] [Court of Criminal Appeals] of Alabama?
$\qquad$ Yes $\qquad$ No"
(c) Electorate Vote. Any appellate judicial officer who seeks an additional term for the same appellate judicial
office shall be retained in office by vote of the electorate in the general election. The retention election shall be nonpartisan. For a justice or an appellate judge to be retained, he or she must be approved by the affirmative vote of a majority of those voting in the retention election. Section 11. Evaluation of Appellate Judicial Officers.
(a) Purpose. There is hereby established within the state a judicial evaluation program that will do all of the following:
(1) Provide persons voting on the retention of state appellate judicial officers with fair, responsible, and constructive information about judicial performance.
(2) Facilitate self-improvement of such appellate judicial officers.
(3) Identify the need for improvements in the contents of judicial education.
(4) Increase public awareness of the work of the judiciary.
(5) Ensure that the quality of state appellate judicial officers, and their performance, is maintained at the highest level.
(b) Judicial Evaluation Commission. For the evaluation of appellate judicial officers subject to a retention election, there shall be a Judicial Evaluation Commission. The appointment of members, and the activities and
operations of the commission, shall be governed by the following provisions:
(1) Membership. The membership shall be comprised of 11 members at least two of whom shall be women, selected as follows:
a. Five Non-attorney Members: Five members who are not attorneys licensed to practice law in the state, including at least two who are African-Americans, shall be appointed by the Governor, Lieutenant Governor, and the Speaker of the House acting as a group.
b. Four Attorney Members: Three members who are licensed to practice law in the State of Alabama shall be elected by the Board of Bar Commissioners of the Alabama State Bar, which shall give due consideration in making such elections to assuring that a cross-section of the Bar is represented on the commission. One member who is licensed to practice law in the state shall be appointed by the Alabama Lawyers Association, or its successor, by means of a process which that association authorizes.
c. Two Judicial Members: One member shall be the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court. The other judicial member shall be either the Presiding Judge of the Court of Civil Appeals or the Presiding Judge of the Court of Criminal Appeals as designated by the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court.
(2) Chair and Vice Chair. The Judicial Evaluation Commission members shall elect a chair and a vice chair every
three years. The chair shall preside at all meetings of the commission and shall be the designated spokesperson for the commission. In the absence of the chair, the vice chair shall preside.
(3) Qualifications and Restrictions.
a. All members shall be qualified voters of the state.
b. No member shall be eligible for appointment to a state appellate judicial office while that member serves on the Judicial Evaluation Commission and for one year thereafter.
c. With the exception of the judicial members, no member of the Judicial Evaluation Commission may hold any office under the United States, the state, or any other governmental entity, for which compensation is received, other than as a member of a military reserve component.
d. A judicial member shall not participate in or vote on his or her own evaluation.
(4) Diversity. All appointments and elections of members to the Judicial Evaluation Commission shall be made with due consideration to the geographic, including both rural and urban geographic areas, gender, racial and ethnic diversity of the state, and without regard to political affiliation.
(5) Terms of Office.
a. Full term of office. The term of office for each member, other than the judicial members, shall be for a period
of six years, except as is provided for in paragraph b. of this subdivision.
b. Initial term. In order that the membership terms of the Judicial Evaluation Commission be staggered, the initial terms of the attorney and non-attorney members shall be as follows:

1. Non-attorney members: The initial term of the members who are not attorneys and who are appointed by the Governor, Lieutenant Governor, and the Speaker of the House shall be:
(i) Two members - two years.
(ii) One member - three years.
(iii) Two members - four years.
2. Attorney members: The initial terms for attorney members elected by the State Bar Association shall be:
(i) One attorney - two years.
(ii) One attorney - three years.
(iii) One attorney - fours years.

The attorney selected by the Alabama Lawyers
Association shall serve an initial term of three years.
c. Subsequent terms. After the initial term, all appointments, except to fill vacancies, shall be for the full term. No person may serve more than two full terms, neither an initial term under paragraph b. of this subdivision, nor an appointment under paragraph $d$. of this subdivision to fill a vacancy, shall be deemed to be a "full term".
d. Vacancies. If a vacancy occurs, the designated appointing or electing authority shall select a qualified person to complete the unexpired portion of the term.
(6) Powers and Duties of the Commission. The powers and duties of the Judicial Evaluation Commission are hereby established as follows: To develop and implement techniques and procedures for evaluating all justices and appellate judges subject to retention.
(c) Recommendations on Retention of Justices and Appellate Judges.
(1) Procedure. In order to be eligible for retention evaluation, a justice or an appellate judge must provide written notification to the Judicial Evaluation Commission within the time frame established by the commission of his or her intent to stand for retention election. The Judicial Evaluation Commission shall conduct an evaluation of all justices and appellate judges, as appropriate, who have timely notified the commission that they intend to stand for retention election. The evaluation shall be completed and a narrative profile prepared for communication to the respective justice or appellate judge within a reasonable period of time prior to the last day on which a justice or an appellate judge can publicly declare, by filing a declaration with the Secretary of State, his or her intent to stand for retention election. The justice or appellate judge shall have the opportunity to meet with the commission, or otherwise respond to the evaluation, within a reasonable time following receipt
of such evaluation. If such a meeting is held or response is made, the commission may revise its evaluation. The commission shall adopt rules of procedure, including the necessary time requirements, to effectuate this section.
(2) Report to the Public. After the requirement in subdivision (1) of this subsection is met, the Judicial Evaluation Commission shall compile a narrative summary of the evaluation findings and, no later than 60 days prior to the retention election, make recommendations to the public regarding the justices or appellate judges subject to retention. The recommendation shall be stated as either a. retain, b. do not retain, or c. no opinion. With respect to a recommendation of retain or do not retain, a narrative explanation may be provided to the public when, in the discretion of the commission, such an explanation is deemed necessary to meet the purposes of the commission as set forth in this section.
(d) Reimbursement and Administrative Assistance.
(1) Expenses. Members of the Judicial Nominating Commission and the Judicial Evaluation Commission shall not be compensated, but shall be reimbursed by the judicial branch of government for all reasonable and necessary travel expenses incurred in the carrying out of their official duties.
(2) Assistance. The Administrative Office of Courts shall provide administrative assistance and support to each commission in the carrying out of the respective commission's official duties.
(e) Powers of the Judicial Evaluation Commission. The commission shall have the power to adopt reasonable rules and procedures to aid in its evaluation of the judicial performance of justices and appellate judges standing for retention election.
(f) Privileged Information. All documents and information obtained by or submitted to the Judicial Evaluation Commission, and all results of judicial recommendations or evaluations, are absolutely privileged and confidential and no judicial action predicated thereon may be brought in any court. Statements made to these commissions are absolutely privileged and confidential; provided, however, that this absolute privilege and confidentiality does not apply to statements made in any other forum. Members of these commissions and staff shall be immune from suit and liability for any conduct in the course of their official duties.

Section 12. Sections 17-6-20, 17-6-24, 17-6-25, 17-6-48, and 17-13-8, Code of Alabama 1975, are amended to read as follows:

> "§17-6-20.
"(a) In all elections held in this state on any subject which may be submitted by law to the vote of the people and for all or any state, county, district, or municipal officers, the voting shall be by official ballot printed and distributed as provided in this chapter, except when the form of the ballot is otherwise prescribed by law, or when the use of voting machines is authorized. No ballot shall
be received or counted in any election except as prescribed by law lout this. This section shall not apply to elections held for trustees of public schools or other local elections which are otherwise specifically provided for by law.
"(b) The names of all candidates for state appellate judicial offices and attorney general shall be placed on the ballot without any type of party designation.
"§17-6-24.
"(a) All ballots shall be printed in black ink on clear book paper, and every ballot printed in accordance with the pions of this chapter and shall contain a party device for each political party represented on the ticket. The arrangement of the ballot shall in general conform substantially to the plan hereinafter given, and in all cases the party columns must be placed in alphabetical order, beginning on the left of the ballot. The list of candidates of the several parties shall be printed in parallel and perpendicular columns, each. Each column to shall be headed by the chosen device of such party and the party name or other designation in such order as the Secretary of State may direct. The number of columns shall exceed by one the number of separate tickets of candidates to be voted for at the polling place for which the ballot is provided, and in . In the appropriate place the words vote for one, for two or other number, as the case may bet, shall be placed to indicate the number which may be elected to each office. There shall be a separate section on the ballot without any party device or
symbol appearing which shall be designated only as the "Official Attorney General and Nonpartisan Judicial Ballot" and which shall list all candidates seeking state appellate judicial office and state attorney general. On the right of each ballot shall be a column in which shall be printed only the titles of the office for which candidates may be voted for by the electors at the polling places for which the ballot is printed. The column is designated as "blank column," and in such the column the voting spaces shall be omitted, but in all other respects such blank column shall be a duplicate of the political party columns upon the ballot.
"(b) The ballot style and design shall be in substantial conformity with rules promulgated by the Secretary of State under the Administrative Procedure Act.
"§17-6-25.
"The names of candidates for each office shall be listed on the ballot in alphabetical order by surname, and the offices shall be listed in the following order:
"(1) President (if preference primary).
"(2) Delegate to national convention.
"(3) Governor.
"(4) Lieutenant Governor.
"(5) United States senator.
"(6) United States representative.
"(7) Attorney General.
"(7)(7) State senator.
(8) State representative.
"(10) Supreme Court Justice.
"(11) Court of Civil Appeals judge.
"(12) Court of Ciniminal Appeals judge.
"(13)(9) Secretary of State.
"(14)(10) State Treasurer.
"(15)(11) State Auditor.
"(16)(12) Commissioner of Agriculture and
Industries.
"(17)(13) Public Service Commissioner.
"(18)(14) State Board of Education member.
"(19)(15) Circuit court judge.
"(20)(16) District attorney.
"(21)(17) District court judge.
"(22)(18) Circuit clerk.
"(23)(19) Other public officers, to be listed in the order prescribed by the judge of probatet.
"(24)(20) Other party officers, to be listed in the order prescribed by the judge of probatet.
"§17-6-48.
"In all primary and general elections of associate
justices of the Suprene Court of Alabana, justices of the eourts of appeals of Alabama, judges of the circuit and district courts, and associate members of the public service commission, judges, or officers are to be elected at the same time, each of such the places to be filled shall be designated by number by the Secretary of State.
"§17-13-8.
"(a) Separate official ballots and other election stationery and supplies for each political party shall be printed and furnished for use at each election district or precinct and shall be of a different color for each of the political parties participating in such primary election. All ballots for the same political party shall be alike, except as herein othe provise printed in plain type and upon paper so thick that the printing cannot be distinguished from the back. Across the top of the ballot shall be printed the party's emblem, if any, and the words, "Official Primary Election Ballot." Beneath this heading shall be printed the year in which the election is held and the words "Democratic Party" or "Republican Party" or other proper party designation. Each group of candidates to be voted on shall be preceded by the designation of the office for which the candidates seek nomination, and in the proper place shall be printed the words "Vote for one" or "Vote for two" (or more) according to the number to be elected to such office at the ensuing election.
"At the option of a political party at the bottom of the ballot and after the name of the last candidate shall be printed the following: "By casting this ballot I do pledge myself to abide by the result of this primary election and to aid and support all the nominees thereof in the ensuing general election."
"Should any voter scratch out, deface, or in any way mutilate or change the pledge printed on the ballot, the voter shall not be considered or held to have repudiated or to have refused to take the pledge, but shall, conclusively, be presumed and held to have scratched out, defaced, or mutilated or changed the same for the sole purpose of identifying the ballot; and, accordingly, such ballot shall be marked "spoiled ballot" and shall not be counted."

Section 13. This act shall become effective on the first day of the third month following its passage and approval by the Governor, or its otherwise becoming law.

